

You Are the Editor

First Read Review

For the first read-through, see if you have suggestions to improve ideas or organization.

1. **Thesis:** Find the writer's thesis. Highlight it, underline it or write it here. As you read the essay, look for points that demonstrate that the ideas in the thesis are supported. If you cannot find the thesis, make a note.

Is the thesis specific? Circle: Yes / No If no, how can it be improved?	
Is it arguable? (Could someone else have a different opinion/interpretation?) Circle: Yes / No If no, how can it be improved?	
Is it supportable? Circle: Yes / No If no, how can it be improved?	

You Are the Editor

2. Development and Organization: Consider the following questions and offer suggestions to the writer for improvement:

- Does the writer include details and support for the thesis?
- Do the details flow in a logical order?
- Are they clearly explained? If not, what should be explained more clearly?
- Is there any point that conflicts with the book?

Comments to the Writer:

3. Introduction and Conclusion:

- Does the introduction retell the story or does it give the reader context for the thesis?
- Does the conclusion offer the reading a significant "take-away" or does it merely repeat the introduction?

Comments to the Writer:

You Are the Editor

4. **Body Paragraphs:** Look for the following in each of the three body paragraphs:

- Does each body paragraph begin with a topic sentence that clearly states the point the paragraph will focus on?
- Does each body paragraph include details that back up or illustrate the point?
- Does each body paragraph contain a specific reference to or quotation from the novel?
- Does each body paragraph keep its focus on the point mentioned in the topic sentence?

Comments to the Writer:

Second Read Review

After reviewing the paper for ideas, go back through to look for improvements that could be made to style, grammar, and punctuation.

1. **Sentence Structure:** Does the writer use rambling, run-on sentences? Short choppy sentences? Offer suggestions for breaking up or combining sentences so ideas are more connected and concise. Mark the paper for the writer.
2. **Transitions:** Are ideas connected with words and phrases that link them logically? (transition words and phrases include *furthermore*, *for example*, *in contrast*, *therefore*, *consequently*, *although*, *etc.*) Mark the paper where transitions are missing. Hint: look between main points and between paragraphs.

You Are the Editor

3. Grammar: Mark the paper for the writer.

Pronoun use

- Do the pronouns match up to the words they refer to? Is the pronoun reference clear?
- Do pronouns match in number (singular/plural) and gender to the word they replace?

Verb use

- Do the verbs match the subject in number and gender?
- Do the verb tenses shift from present to past for no reason?

Sentence structure

- Are phrases placed near the words they modify?
- Are clauses used effectively to vary sentence type?

Punctuation: Mark the paper for the writer.

- Are commas used correctly?
- Are any periods missing?

General Comments to the Writer: